Comparative Analysis: Conceptualization of Teacher Quality in Indonesia and Singapore

Ummu Khairiyah1*, Pance Mariati2, Nadi Suprapto3, Neni Mariana4

1 PGMI, Universitas Islam Lamongan, Lamongan, Indonesia
2 PGSD, Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia
3, 4 Pascasarjana, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia

*Corresponding author: ummukhairiyah@unisla.ac.id

Abstract

Various countries have attempted to create standards of teacher competency that must be possessed with the ultimate goal of improving the quality of teachers and the education system in educational institutions. The purpose of this study is to analyze and compare the conception of teacher quality in the education systems of Indonesia and Singapore. The research method used in this study involves a literature review of articles and books that discuss the conception of teacher quality in Indonesia and Singapore. The steps in this research include topic identification, literature search, literature selection, literature evaluation, literature analysis, interpretation of analysis result, and article writing. The results of this research indicate that Singapore is known to have one of the best education systems in the world, with a strong focus on teacher quality. Singapore has successfully developed high-quality teachers and provided strong support for the teaching profession. The teacher recruitment system in Singapore is highly selective and competitive, with high standards to ensure that prospective teachers have high competence. Meanwhile, Indonesia still faces challenges in improving the quality and welfare of teachers. However, there have been many efforts made to improve the education system and enhance teacher quality, namely through teacher quality improvement programs such as the Teacher Professional Education (Pendidikan Profesi Guru - PPG) and the Teacher Certification Program.

Keywords: Comparative, Quality Teacher, Indonesia, Singapore

1. INTRODUCTION

Education is the main factor of progress of a nation. Education is created to be a determining force in building a nation based on ideals. Education does not only produce intellectually intelligent human resources, but also has social and spiritual intelligence (Pribudhiana et al., 2021; Stracke, 2019). Each country, especially in Asia, has its own policies to reflect its commitment to improving the quality of education. Many countries emphasize the importance of high-quality teacher education with strict qualification requirements and rigorous teacher education programs. The Ministry of Education and
Culture in Indonesia continues to work to improve the quality of education in the country. There are several factors that can determine the quality of education and one of the most important factors for realizing quality education is qualified teachers as well. According to if there are quality teachers, quality education is easy to achieve (Hidayah & Syahrrani, 2022; Looney et al., 2018).

Singapore has achieved remarkable success in its education system, and one of the key factors in its achievements is the very high quality of its teachers. The country has prioritized the recruitment of highly qualified teachers, provided quality teacher education through rigorous programs, and continues to provide professional training and support to teachers. The result is an education system that is consistently ranked among the top in the world, with students achieving high marks in international examination (Goodwin, 2019; Sa’adah, 2019). However, when we compare Singapore’s educational success with the situation in Indonesia, there are major differences. One of the main differences is the quality of teachers. In Indonesia, teacher qualifications and education vary and are often less rigorous than in Singapore (Pramiarsih, 2019; Ríordáin et al., 2019). This creates an imbalance in the quality of education between the two countries, resulting in a gap in student achievement. Therefore, improvements in teacher quality and investment in teacher education are key steps that Indonesia must take to approach the educational success that Singapore has achieved. In this context, it is interesting to examine the different conceptions of teacher quality in Singapore and Indonesia with two similar education systems but different education outputs.

Teachers have a big role in achieving national education goals. Teachers are in direct contact with students and therefore become central to all supporting components of the national education system. Teachers are also second parents for students at school because they play an important role in building national character (Mäkinen et al., 2019; Mukhamadovna et al., 2020). Many studies have been conducted to describe the indicators of quality teachers (Francis et al., 2019; Supriani et al., 2019). Qualified teachers are educators who determine the success of any educational effort. Quality teachers develop students’ potential, they innovate in teaching and learning, especially in curriculum design and teaching methodology. According to previous study there are three important elements in the design of teacher education programs that are needed to produce quality teachers (Desimone & Pak, 2017). This relates to the preparation of a curriculum that is in line with the readiness of teachers and students. A quality curriculum encourages a practical learning process and produce student understanding through active creativity in the classroom (Fitriani & Nasution, 2022; Ro, 2021). The last element is the learning context related to the creation of the process contextual learning to develop students’ practical skills. Context This learning must be applied both in the realm of teaching and learning in the school environment.

Regarding high performance in Singapore education, teacher quality is consistently used as a key factor in the success of an education. Several studies show that the success of Singapore’s education system is caused by many factors at three independent levels: the macro level (socio-cultural, political-economic factors); organizational level (quality of schools, teachers, curriculum, etc.); and family level (parenting and socialization). The novelty of this study focus on scientific discipline studies education systems both within one country and between countries. Through a comparative analysis of the conceptualization of teacher quality, we can find out how Singapore plans to develop and improve its replicable education system, so that it can provide contributions and recommendations for policy making in order to build and advance the education system in Indonesia.
2. METHODS

This research is a systematic review using literature sources from Scopus and Taylor & Francis Online. The research procedure refers to the systematic review steps (Khan et al., 2003). The search for literature sources used the keywords teacher quality, Singapore education, and Indonesian education. Conduct an analysis of the quality of the journal obtained by seeing whether the contents of the journal can answer the questions that have been compiled and made in the form of data tabulations. Interpret and draw conclusions based on a systematic review to answer the questions that have been prepared.

The steps taken in this research are as follows: first, the author identified a topic that involved a comparative analysis of teacher quality in Indonesia and Singapore. The second step is a literature search. The literature search was carried out by taking articles, books and international and national policy regulations regarding teacher competency in Indonesia and Singapore. The literature search was carried out systematically and structured using relevant keywords. The third step is selecting literature. The reference sources obtained are then selected based on their relevance to the topic being discussed, and references that do not meet the criteria are removed. Fourthly, carry out literature evaluation to assess credibility and relevance to the research topic. Fifth: Conducting literature analysis, selected and evaluated articles are analyzed to collect data and information related to differences in conceptions of teacher quality between Indonesia and Singapore.

Next, carry out data interpretation, data interpretation is carried out to draw conclusions and findings related to variations in the conception of teacher quality in Indonesia and Singapore. Finally, preparing the article: After obtaining conclusions and findings, the article is prepared in accordance with the standard structure and format for writing scientific articles.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

Based on the results of a literature review regarding the comparison of the concept of teacher quality in Indonesia and Singapore, the following is a discussion of the results of the comparison which includes teacher recruitment and selection systems, teacher education and training, teacher professional development, teaching standards and teacher evaluation and teacher welfare. The comparison of teacher quality in Indonesia and Singapore is shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Comparison of Teacher Quality in Indonesia and Singapore

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Indonesia</th>
<th>Singapore</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. | Teacher recruitment and selection system | • Have a minimum of a bachelor's degree  
• Teacher vacancies are published through the official government portal or school website  
• Qualification tests through knowledge, language, psychomotor and interview tests | • At least have a bachelor's degree from a university which is the main reference for creating quality teachers. For example, the National Institute of Education (NIE)  
• Teacher vacancies are announced via the official website of the Ministry of Education (MoE) |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Conceptions of Teacher Quality</th>
<th>Indonesia</th>
<th>Singapore</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2. | Teacher education and training | • Prospective teachers have a bachelor's degree from a tertiary or specialized education institution  
• There is variation in the quality and focus of the curriculum across colleges graduating teacher candidates  
• Teachers attend training organized by local governments and the schools where they will teach. The training focuses on the education system and school curriculum | • Strict selection stages by the MoE consisting of interviews, teaching tests and skills assessments  
• Prospective teachers have a bachelor's degree in the subject they will teach. They must also pass a teacher training program recognized by the Ministry of Education.  
• The teacher education curriculum is rigorous and focuses on developing effective teaching skills, a deep understanding of the subject and classroom management skills.  
• The initial training program includes teaching practice in a designated school and mentoring by experienced teachers. |   |
| 3. | Teacher professional development | • There are various teacher professional development (PPG) programs organized by the government and educational institutions. However, the quality and accessibility of these programs may vary in different regions. | • it has a highly structured and focused professional development program guided by professional mentors. Teacher professional development is strongly linked to performance evaluation results |   |
| 4. | Teachers teaching and evaluation standards | • Teaching standards include core competencies that teachers should have such as an understanding of the national curriculum and teaching skills.  
• Evaluation is conducted by the school principal. However, the evaluation process can vary between schools and regions and is not always related to professional development or incentives.  
• There is no specific national exam to measure teacher quality nationally | • Teaching standards include an in-depth understanding of the national curriculum, effective teaching ability and classroom management skills.  
• Evaluations are conducted regularly by principals, fellow teachers and education officials. Evaluation results can affect teachers' careers and professional development opportunities  
• Have a licensed teacher exam that prospective |   |
### Conceptions of Teacher Quality

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Indonesia</th>
<th>Singapore</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 5. | Teacher welfare | • Non-civil servant teacher salaries vary according to school conditions  
• There are allowances for teachers, although they are limited and vary based on the location and conditions of the school  
• Teacher certification applies to teachers who pass the Professional Teacher Education (PPG) program. | • In addition to high teacher salaries, there are additional allowances and performance bonuses for achieving good results in teaching.  
• The Singapore government provides financial support to help ensure the welfare of teachers. |

A comparative study of teacher quality between Singapore and Indonesia reveals significant differences that are one of the main factors in the success of Singapore’s education system. Teachers in Singapore are known for having high academic qualifications, with the majority of them holding undergraduate and postgraduate degrees in education. In addition, they also undergo regular advanced training and professional development to update their skills in line with the latest developments in education. In addition, teacher selection in Singapore is rigorous, ensuring that only the best individuals with high competencies can teach in their schools. In addition to strict qualifications and selection, Singapore’s generous incentive system gives teachers an extra push to deliver their best performance. Teacher salaries in Singapore are relatively high, and there are bonus programs and allowances for teachers who demonstrate superior performance. This creates an environment where teachers feel valued and motivated to continuously improve the quality of their teaching. The transparent teacher performance evaluation system also helps to create high accountability.

On the other hand, the situation is different in Indonesia. While there are many committed and dedicated teachers in Indonesia, there are still challenges related to qualifications and professional development. Many teachers in Indonesia have lower educational qualifications and limited access to advanced training and development. In addition, Indonesia’s teacher selection system does not fully ensure that only the best and most qualified individuals can teach in education institutions. Some previous studies generally only explain how the quality of education in Singapore. Whereas one of the factors of quality education is the quality of its educators. Therefore, this article will present a detailed comparison of the quality of teachers in Singapore and Indonesia along with a comparison of the conceptualization of quality teachers between Singapore and Indonesia so that it can be used as a reference for improving the quality of education in Indonesia.

**Discussion**

**Singapore Teacher Quality**

In Singapore, education is seen as central to economic survival and progress and is seen to be integrally tied to the larger overall goal of nation-building (Goodwin et al., 2017; Ríordáin et al., 2019). Singapore devotes a large portion of its national budget to education. Singapore has several measures and policies that help them acquire quality teachers. Singapore has a very strict teacher selection process. The strict teacher selection process in Singapore is seen as a good gateway in controlling the quality of prospective teachers.
Prospective teachers must pass a series of comprehensive tests, interviews and assessments (Goodwin & Low, 2021; Low & Tan, 2017). They must demonstrate high academic caliber, good teaching skills, and possess strong leadership and communication qualities. Selection of direct teacher recruitment is managed by Singapore's Ministry of Education, namely the Ministry of Education (MoE) and the National Institute of Education (NIE). NIE is the best quality autonomous institute in the world for teacher education. So that the process of recruitment, education, to sustainable teacher professional development, schools always involve MoE, and NIE. The MOE provides each teacher with an allowance and covers school fees for the pre-service program. But in the recruiting system, the MoE only accepts applications from the top third of each group of graduates. And only one out of eight who intervened was accepted. In this process, MoE and NIE not only consider the final exam scores, but also aspects of the attitudes and talents of prospective students to become teachers (Bautista et al., 2015; Jiménez et al., 2014).

After becoming teachers, they continue to receive regular professional training. The Government of Singapore provides a variety of professional development programs for teachers, including training in the use of technology in education, upgrading teaching skills, and leadership development (Liew, 2012; Rajandiran, 2022). Teachers in Singapore are regularly assessed and evaluated to ensure the quality of their teaching remains high. There is a strict monitoring system that includes observers and authorities who provide feedback and suggestions to teachers to improve their performance.

Singapore provides incentives and awards to qualified teachers. Teachers who achieve high levels of achievement can be given bonuses, awards, and opportunities for further professional development programs. Teachers are given the opportunity to take 100 hours per year for professional development (PD) which is financed by the MoE (Lee & Tan, 2010; Pramiarsih, 2019). This provides additional motivation for teachers to continuously improve the quality of their teaching. Singapore has been working to elevate the status of the teaching profession. Education in the field of education is considered important and valued in society. It creates a positive environment for talented individuals to choose careers as teachers and provides extensive support from society and government.

**Indonesian Teacher Quality**

Indonesia is also trying to obtain qualified teachers with various measures and policies, although the challenges it faces are still quite large. The following are some of the steps taken by Indonesia in an effort to improve teacher quality. The Indonesian government is focusing on improving teacher education qualifications. Teachers are expected to have an undergraduate degree in a related field, and there are also graduate programs available for those who wish to further their education (Lisnawati, 2018; Prihono et al., 2022).

In recent years, the government has also introduced a Bachelor of Education program as a minimum requirement to become a teacher. To become CPNS teachers based on Permendikbud Number 87 of 2013 they must add to their studies by participating in the Teacher Education Program. Apart from that, there is the ASN PPPK Teacher route, which must pass through a selection stage held by the government. To recruit quality teachers, not all honorary teachers are appointed as PPPK. Improving teacher training and professional development is an important component of efforts to obtain quality teachers (Andina & Arifa, 2021; Indrawati & Octoria, 2016). The government provides training programs and workshops for teachers to improve teaching skills, curriculum understanding, use of technology in education, and leadership development.

The Indonesian government has launched a teacher certification program to ensure that teachers meet certain standards. Through this program, teachers must follow a series of assessment and evaluation processes to obtain a certificate as proof of their qualifications and
Comparative Analysis: Conceptualization of Teacher Quality in Indonesia and Singapore

Competence as teachers. The teacher selection process has become increasingly selective in recent years. Prospective teachers must pass a rigorous competency test and interview to be accepted as a teacher. This step aims to ensure that individuals who become teachers have the potential and qualities needed to teach well. The government continues to develop relevant and innovative curricula to support teaching quality. The national curriculum is updated regularly to meet the needs and demands of the times, as well as integrating character education into learning. The Indonesian government provides incentives and awards to quality teachers (Anggareni et al., 2013; Siregar, 2020). This includes salary increases, benefits, professional development opportunities, and achievement awards for teachers who achieve good results in their teaching.

The Indonesian government seeks to improve the quality of teachers by providing performance allowances. Through the provision of performance allowances, certified teachers are expected to have better performance than teachers who have not been certified (Aulia et al., 2023; Koswara & Rasto, 2016). The forms of teacher performance allowance are teacher professional allowance (TPG), functional allowance, remote area allowance, performance-based allowance, qualification allowance, and achievement allowance. It is important to remember that improving the quality of teaching is a very important goal in the education system, and the teacher performance allowance program is one of the tools that can be used to achieve this goal (Kartomo & Slameto, 2016; Taufan, 2022). However, the program must be designed and managed wisely in order to achieve the desired results. If there is no positive correlation between teacher performance allowance and teaching quality, then there needs to be improvements and adjustments in the design and implementation of the program.

The government is working with educational institutions, universities and community organizations to improve the quality of teachers. This collaboration includes the provision of training programs, technical assistance and supervision. Although there are still challenges that need to be overcome, Indonesia continues to improve teacher quality through measures such as upgrading qualifications, training and development, certification, selective selection, curriculum development, incentives, and collaboration with related parties. All these steps aim to improve the quality of education in Indonesia through qualified teachers.

**Conceptualization of teacher quality: comparing Indonesia and Singapore**

Developing teachers to become qualified professionals is beneficial to the education system and nations everywhere. In a country that prioritizes teacher quality, Singapore requires its teachers to be governed by a series of professional ethos and have a moral and ethical commitment to the nation, society and children (Liu et al., 2018; Pribudhiana et al., 2021). While there may be some differences in the approach between Singapore and Indonesia in ensuring teacher quality, the main difference lies in how each country implements its own teaching standards. Singapore provides explicit direction in general understanding of teaching or subject matter and in specific pedagogical practices that teachers must master. With a centralized-decentralized education system, Singapore designs policies from a centralized position and decentralizes them to schools which then have the autonomy to choose how to enforce these policies according to the pace of learning and the needs of their students. According to previous study views quality teachers, namely teachers who are able to carry out holistic education (Ro, 2021). Centralized standards enable teachers and Singapore to align goals and be coherent with the national education vision.

The Singaporean and Indonesian Reflective Teaching Models provide teachers with a framework for how to observe, reflect, plan and act on their teaching processes and practices in the context of self-knowledge, teaching and learning knowledge, student knowledge, school knowledge and community contexts, and knowledge of the content. In terms of
teacher quality, it generally depends on the selection of prospective teachers, the quality of teacher educators, the teacher education curriculum and the assessment process.

4. CONCLUSION

Overall, a comparison of teacher quality between Indonesia and Singapore reflects significant differences in various key aspects. Singapore stands out for its rigorous recruitment system, structured teacher education and training, strong professional development, high teaching standards and good teacher welfare. Meanwhile, Indonesia faces challenges in a more varied recruitment system, teacher education and training that needs to be strengthened, professional development that is still developing, varying teaching standards, and teacher welfare which is a major concern. Improving teacher quality in Indonesia will require greater investment and reform to bring about significant change in education, while Singapore has demonstrated a strong commitment to maintaining teacher quality in its highly structured education system.

5. REFERENCES


