Selection Process of School Principals in Indonesia and Some Other Countries

Muhamad Sholeh1*, Windsari2, Dwi Nining Lestari3, Bambang Sigit Widodo4

1 Educational Management, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia
2 Educational Management, Faculty of Education, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia
3 Environmental protection and management, Faculty of Biology, Jagiellonian University, Polandia
4 Geography Education, Faculty of Social Sciences and Law, Universitas Negeri Surabaya, Indonesia

A B S T R A C T


A B S T R A C T

The vital roles of school principals and the need for a professional selection and preparation process for school principals have encouraged the necessity of studying the process of preparing school principals in Indonesia. In developed countries, the main candidates are judged not only on their traditional management skills but also on their professional leadership skills. Principals are responsible for improving the quality of the schools they lead, so in developed countries, that becomes the main focus of assessment. In Indonesia, the policy for the preparation and selection process of school principals must be reviewed in a goal-oriented manner for the sake of improving education quality. This research aimed to providing recommendations for improving the selection process of principals in Indonesia through a comparative analysis. Method in this research using literature review. This literature review collected data or sources related to a particular topic derived from various sources, such as journals, books, the internet, and other libraries. The results of the discussion indicated that there were similarities and differences in the selection processes for principals in Indonesia and the comparative countries in this study. Since the rules for selecting school principals in Indonesia often change, school principal candidates must always adapt to new regulations.

1. INTRODUCTION

A principal plays an important role in a sustainable, dynamic, and constantly changing school transformation. Principals are "expected to be instructional leaders who are accountable for student achievement as well as change agents who lead school transformation because both carry an emotional component to school members" (Anne Tansiongco & Ibarra, 2020; Mahfouz, 2020). Principals are responsible for overseeing many facets of the school community, working with stakeholders, and resolving conflicts (Dike, 2019; Maxwell & Riley, 2017; Nurochim & Ngaisah, 2020). According to earlier
research, effective principals are linked to high school quality and student academic achievement (Damayanti & Jumiyati, 2020; Divayana et al., 2019; Hallinger et al., 2020). Additionally, a strong principal's leadership will foster a healthy school climate, as well as teachers' self-efficacy and well-being, which will enhance their performance and retention (Kartini et al., 2020; McCarley et al., 2016). A good principal will foster beneficial relationships between the school and parents/guardians and develop coordination between parents/guardians, teachers, students, and outside parties.

Therefore, competent principals must be prepared to deliver high-quality education. The preparation for qualified human resources is one of the challenging issues faced by an institution (Kartini et al., 2020; Pessach D et al., 2020; Yulis, 2020). The findings of previous study indicated that the organization in which the principal works will be significantly impacted by the preparation or recruitment process for good human resources (Acikgoz, 2018). For the organization to survive, the process of creating good quality human resources is crucial. The outcome of studies on the training of human resource candidates holds the key to an organization’s success. Factors affecting failure in the HR preparation process consist of poor finance, selection team ethics, and policies. The success factor of the human resource preparation process lies in the design of the recruitment process (Akbaşlı et al., 2017; Kwan, 2010; Phillips & Gully, 2015). In addition to the recruitment design, the principal’s preparation strategy must be considered. Therefore, decision-makers must prepare a design process and strategy for training school principals. The process of developing a good principal will immediately correlate with the development of all-school-wide characteristics. Considering the crucial roles of school principals in Indonesia as well as the professional selection process and training for them, the preparation process for principals in Indonesia must be reviewed. The primary candidates for follow-up are evaluated not only on their traditional management skills but also on their professional leadership abilities in developed countries (Akbaşlı et al., 2017; Minsih et al., 2019; Mukhlasin, 2021). Since principals are accountable for enhancing the standard of the schools they oversee, industrialized countries focus their primary area of assessment on it (Kwan, 2010; Subandi, 2018; Yulis, 2020).

In Indonesia, the policy for preparing and selecting school principals must have a goal-oriented review to improve the quality of education. Previous study stated that school principal have to four attributes: communication skills, student-centered orientation, people skills, and curriculum and instruction knowledge (Palmer, 2016). In Indonesia, most of all candidate indicate in the low principal's competency test. According to the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia's report, the 2019 Principal Competency Test had an average score of 56.37, with the highest score 61.47 for principals in the Province of Special Region of Yogyakarta and the lowest score (52.09) for principals in North Maluku Province (Hartanto, 2019; Muhammad & Widyanto, 2019; Noor & Sofyaningrum, 2020). In order to better understand the research's overall problem. This research aimed to providing recommendations for improving the selection process of principals in Indonesia through a comparative analysis of the recruitment process in Turkey and various industrialized countries.

2. METHOD

This study belongs to a literature review which refers to a technique for gathering information or sources about a specific subject from a variety of sources, including journals, books, the internet, and other references. The previous research and official documents were reviewed and evaluated to produce appropriate outcomes. The chosen documents have been relevant to the study’s topic. As explained in (Templier & Paré, 2015), this article used six step for article review as follows, 1.) formulating the research question(s) and objective(s), 2.) searching the extant literature, 3.) screening for inclusion, 4.) assessing the quality of primary studies, 5.) extracting data, and 6.) analyzing data. Australia, America, Shanghai, Hong Kong, Germany, and Finland were selected in this study as they were considered to be in line with the research objectives. Shanghai and Hong Kong are allied regions of Asia with Indonesia. Australia is the closest country to Indonesia, while America is a developed country that becomes a barometer of world education. Germany and Finland are the highest-ranking countries in Europe. This research using literature review analysis, the resource from google scholar databases and science direct database. Total article collected from the first round 397 article. Total article screened based on abstract and skimming of the body text, finally found 73 article for the further analysis. The flowchart from this literature review can be seen in Figure 1.
3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

Principal Preparation in Indonesia

The most tactical educators to advance the front line in the national education system are the heads of schools and madrasahs. In order to diminish or even eliminate the differences in the credentials and abilities of principals/madrasahs between Indonesian areas, numerous attempts have been made. The first step in efforts to standardize principals and madrasahs is the Regulation of the Minister of National Education Number 13 of 2007 about Standards for Principals/Madrasahs. In this educational regulation, the minimum requirements for principals and madrasahs have been established and are applicable to all TK/RA (Kindergartens), SD/MI (Elementary Schools), SMP/MTs (Junior High Schools), and SMA/MA/SMK (Senior High Schools) across Indonesia.

In addition, the Decree of National Education Minister Number 162/U/2003 concerning Guidelines for Assigning Teachers as School Principals needs to be harmonized with the Regulation of National Education Minister Number 13 of 2007. Therefore, the Ministry of National Education issued Regulation of the Minister of National Education Number 28 of 2010 regarding the Assignment of Teachers as Principals of Schools/Madrasahs. The Regulation of National Education Minister Number 28 of 2010 primarily regulates the following: requirements for teachers who are given additional responsibilities as school or madrasah principals, training for prospective Principals/Madrasahs, the selection process for school or madrasah principals, tenure, ongoing professional development, evaluation of principals’ and madrasahs’ performance, and transfers and dismissals of teachers’ responsibilities as principals/madrasah. The most recent policy, the Regulation of National Education Minister Number 6 of 2018, governs the process for selecting teachers to serve as principals with the intention of choosing teachers with the most relevant experience and leadership ability. The mechanism is implemented through a recruitment procedure that includes the following steps: (1) creation of projections for school principals, (2) nomination of candidates by school principals and/or supervisors, (3) administrative
selection, (4) academic selection, (5) training and education programs, and (6) appointment of school principals. The stage of administrative selection evaluates the major candidate's documentation for completeness based on that minister's regulation. In order for the principal candidate documents to be considered complete, they must meet the following criteria: (1) possess a minimum academic qualification of undergraduate (S-1) or diploma level four (D-IV) from a university and an accredited study program with a grade of at least B; (2) possess an educator certificate; and (3) possess a minimum of six years of teaching experience depending on the type and level of each school.

Personality, managerial, entrepreneurial, supervision, and social competencies are just a few of the predetermined competency standards that principals must meet. That mechanism is implemented through a recruitment procedure that includes the following steps: (1) creation of projections for school principals, (2) nomination of candidates by school principals and/or supervisors, (3) administrative selection, (4) academic selection, (5) training and education programs, and (6) appointment of school principals. The education and training of prospective principals are carried out in face-to-face activities and field experience practices which are divided into 3 stages, namely In-Service Learning 1, On-the-Job Learning (OJL), and In-Service Learning 2. The selection process for principals is carried out through two methods namely a written test and an interview.

The Differences Principal Preparation in Several Countries

Principal Preparation in Australia

The selection process for preparing school principals in Australia is carried out using two main stages, namely: (1) Determining the standard for the classification of principals, and (2) the selection process for principals. To set the standard for classifying prospective principals, the following stages must be conducted: (1) classification, (2) selection criteria, (3) and qualifications. At classification stage, the prospective principal must fit the principal's primary job descriptions such as charged for delivering an extensive curriculum, upholding community responsibilities through school governance and in charge of overseeing the management of the school's financial and human resources. Move to selection criteria are designed to see the match between the applicant's requirements and the applicant's competence. The following are the six selection criteria that have been developed, vision and values, formulate capacity to create a shared vision, define and create school goals, and set and communicate expectations for effective performance. Teaching and learning, demonstrate ability to manage teaching quality. Then demonstrate ability to generate and implement innovation-based improvement plans, policies, and evidence. Demonstrate capacity to ensure the school's human and financial resources are allocated efficiently. Demonstrate the ability to create professional learning and support for the development of human resources in schools and demonstrate the capacity to develop positive relationships with students, parents/families, and the community.

A teacher who takes part in the selection process must complete four years of training to be eligible for the position of principal. In addition, a number of steps that prospective school principals must pass during the selection process include the classification requirements will be received by the recruitment committee after the closing date. Next, the Chair of the selection panel is responsible for dispersing the recruitment results (either electronically or in print) to the members of the selection panel. The selection committee at this phase creates a series of inquiries based on the selection criteria. Each applicant is chosen based on their ability to exhibit the knowledge, skills, and behaviours that most closely match the necessary competencies during the interview. Panels must create a reliable and equitable evaluation system. Reporting result refers to the vital part. The applicant occupying the highest rank is eligible for the position of principal.

Principal Preparation in Shanghai

In Shanghai, training educational leadership is followed by the promotion of qualified teachers as part of the process of preparing school principals. The educational leadership development program consists of five different types of training: (1) training for aspiring school leaders, (2) annual assignment training for school principals, (3) middle-class managers training, (4) district-level training for school principals, and (5) training for exemplary school principals. Every teacher in Shanghai is required to complete leadership training, and some of them can continue their education to become highly skilled leaders or educators. Shanghai has started to choose and train 1,000 young teacher candidates every year from a variety of academic specialties since 2005. When the number reaches 5,000 in five years, 10% of them will be trained to become outstanding city teachers and department heads who are well-known, and 100 of them will receive training to become national-level expert teachers who can understand educational ideas both domestically and overseas, has strong capability in teaching and research, and participate in global educational exchange programs. The current principal has a greater long-term
responsibility in developing the school. They must plan and organize future strategies for their schools. Therefore, they must understand strategic planning. The Shanghai Municipal Education Commission has established a three-phase program in the Leading Teacher and Principal Training Project in Primary Education and has made remarkable achievements since 2005. Since then, Shanghai has selected and nurtured 200 very ambitious young and middle-aged principals who have strong and potential management skills. Every 5 years, the number increases to 1,000, and 100 of them will be developed into the city’s top school principals who become the reference for teachers and participate in international and corporate teacher exchanges; ten school principals will be selected to become exemplary school principals at the national level. Shanghai’s secondary and high school principals are divided into four echelons and twelve grade levels. Each grade level lasts for two years, however, if a principal receives excellent reviews, they may be promoted one grade level higher in a single year. Additionally, administrators who have made remarkable contributions to education are given special higher degrees. In Shanghai, there are roughly 30% senior-level principals and just about 5% special-level principals.

**Principal Preparation in Hongkong**

The execution of an effective school is greatly influenced by the principal. According to Blackmore, Thompson, and Barty, school administrators were hired with the goal of closing the disparity in educational quality. In Hong Kong, principals and experienced school supervisors who have been appointed by the government conduct interviews to choose school leaders. The selection criteria for principals must be taken into consideration by school supervisors in Hong Kong when choosing school principals. These requirements include the capacity to inspire employees, hold people accountable for their performance, and create and put into practice ideas for school improvement. An interview selection form with a 4-point scale, from strongly agree to strongly disagree, was utilized to choose the principals. These four competencies will afterward serve as the standard by which the recruitment team will evaluate potential principals.

**Principal Preparation in Finland**

The social standing of the principal in Finland is valued highly. It is believed that what they do is crucial. However, lately, selecting a principal had grown more and more challenging. The responsibilities of principal administrators vary based on the educational level of the school, as do their recruitment strategies. In Finland, candidates for principal positions must be qualified to teach at the school to which they are applying. Candidates must be in possession of a Certificate in Educational Administration or have successfully completed a university Leadership Education program that offers a Certificate in Educational Administration. Principals chosen for posts are nonetheless expected to have expertise in actual administration in practice, even though there are no particular requirements for job experience. The principal must not only have a teaching certification but also at least a master’s degree. Typical regulation states that experienced instructors are chosen as principals. In several schools connected to the municipalities in Finland, the major hiring procedure is as follows: unfilled posts are announced by the director in charge of education after the present principal announces retirement or separation for whatever reason. Administrations advertise vacant positions on central websites for the workplace, in national teacher magazines, and in at least large regional newspapers. Applications will be accepted within a certain period of time.

Additionally, the applications are compared by at least the administrator, and occasionally the chairman of the school board, a board member who specializes in education, or the full board. The selection procedure can be succinctly stated as follows: making a decision for opening a position of principal, issuing an advertisement, rating the application based on the educational experience and educational level of applicants, and conducting interviews with the Education administrator. The group then determines which applicant is the most qualified. Psychological exams are frequently used in addition to interviews when comparing prospects. A six-month trial period is given to new principals before they are officially hired. In Finland, the local approach appears to be more successful than the centralized one since the management body is the best qualified to assess the needs. Parents, teachers, and other parties can have consultations on the decision of selection.

**Principal Preparation in Germany**

Every state in Germany has its own educational regulations. As a result, their own statutes serve as the foundation for the selection of school administrators and the appointment process. In all states in Germany, principals work for the state as civil employees and typically serve for a lifetime. Thus, it can become a permanent position. The principal can so remain in this role till retirement if an appointment is made. Along with overseeing the hiring and promotion procedures, the Ministry of Education and its
representatives are not only responsible for the selection and promotion process, but also in charge of developing the method of selection. For the authorities, long-term staff planning is necessary to fill vacancies. For this reason, the development of a candidate pool is appropriate for efficient selection and assignment. Candidates for the position of principal must have at least a bachelor's degree and three to five years of experience. The qualification of becoming a vice principal or team leader and being actively involved in teacher training are advantages. However, regular formal evaluations from the administrator and higher exams from the states are also important after teachers' training. Written tests are given in a number of states. No procedure for national public selection is available in Germany. The selection method varies in some states, such as regular formal evaluations, interviews, classroom observations, and candidate personal presentations. At the end of the assessment, the most qualified applicant is chosen as the principal.

Discussion

Research on the Selection Process of School Principals in Indonesia and Some Other Countries (A Comparative Study) is a comparative study that examines the selection process of school principals in several countries, namely Indonesia, Australia, Shanghai, Hong Kong, Finland and Germany. This study aims to compare how each country selects school principals and looks at the differences and similarities between these countries. In Indonesia, the process of selecting school principals begins with the submission of candidates by the Education Office. Candidates then go through several stages of selection, including administrative selection, written selection, interviews, and medical tests (Bandur et al., 2022; Hayati et al., 2020; Mahdum et al., 2019). After that, a final assessment was carried out by the selection committee and the selected candidate for the principal was determined. Meanwhile in Australia and Finland, the selection process is carried out through open recruitment (Akbaşı et al., 2017; Iacono et al., 2019). Candidates for principals can apply in person or through a search conducted by the school board. After that, administrative selection, interviews, and performance appraisal were carried out. The elected principal is then appointed by the school board.

In Shanghai, the selected principals go through two years of leadership training before being appointed as school principals. The selection process begins with administrative selection, written tests, practical tests, and interviews. In Hong Kong and Germany, the selection process starts with open recruitment or through a search conducted by the school board (Dadaczynski et al., 2020; Konstantinidou & Scherer, 2022). The selected principal candidates then go through several selection stages, including administrative selection, interviews, and medical tests. This research shows that each country has a different process for selecting school principals, and these differences can be influenced by cultural factors, the education system, and regulations in each country. There are several similarities in the selection process between countries, including administrative selection, interviews, and performance appraisal. In addition, several countries also conduct leadership training for selected prospective school principals. This study has important implications for the development of the education system in Indonesia and other countries. Through an understanding of the process of selecting principals in other countries, improvements and enhancements can be made to the process of selecting principals in Indonesia. In addition, it can also open insights and provide inspiration for policy makers in the field of education to adopt best practices from other countries in developing a better and more effective education system.

4. CONCLUSION

Based on the discussion of findings, it can be seen that the selection procedures for principals in Indonesia and the comparable countries in this study have some similarities and differences. However, applicants for school principals must constantly adjust to the changing laws because the criteria for selecting school principals in Indonesia are subject to frequent change. Like in Indonesia, tests and interviews are used to choose school principal candidates in some countries analyzed in this research. Specific to Germany, the selection procedure includes observation and personal presentation from prospective school principal candidates. In Indonesia, candidates for school principal must have at least a minimum S1/D IV (undergraduate/diploma IV) degree as their educational background. Unlike Indonesia, Finland can serve as a good model or reference as it stipulates prerequisites for potential main candidates at least a master's degree.

5. REFERENCES


Muhamad Sholeh / Selection Process of School Principals in Indonesia and Some Other Countries


