

Transactional Analysis Counseling to Improve Intercultural Communication of Tourism Vocational Students

Putu Ari Dharmayanti^{1*}, Adi Atmoko², Blasius Boli Lassen³, Muslihati⁴, Luh Putu Sri Lestari⁵ 

^{1,2,3,4} Departemen of Guidance and Counseling, Faculty of Education, State University of Malang, Malang, Indonesia

⁵ Prodi Bimbingan dan konseling, Fakultas ilmu Pendidikan, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Singaraja, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received May 08, 2023

Revised May 11, 2023

Accepted November 30, 2023

Available online December 25, 2023

Kata Kunci:

Konseling Analisis Transaksional, Komunikasi Antar Budaya, Siswa SMK Pariwisata

Keywords:

Transactional Analysis Counseling, Intercultural Communication, Tourism Vocational School students



This is an open access article under the [CC BY-SA](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/) license.

Copyright © 2023 by Author. Published by Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha.

ABSTRAK

Sekolah belum pernah menerapkan teknik khusus dalam pelaksanaan Bimbingan dan Konseling untuk mengembangkan komunikasi antar budaya siswa di sekolah. Permasalahan tersebut menyebabkan kegagalan dalam proses komunikasi yang dapat mengakibatkan memburuknya hubungan sosial antar siswa. Tujuan penelitian ini adalah menganalisis perbedaan komunikasi antarbudaya siswa SMK Pariwisata sebelum dan sesudah intervensi konseling analisis transaksional. Desain penelitian yang digunakan adalah pretest posttest group design. Teknik pengambilan sampel dalam penelitian ini adalah purposive sampling, yaitu pengambilan sampel berdasarkan penilaian peneliti. Penelitian ini menggunakan dua jenis instrumen, yaitu: (1) materi perlakuan modul konseling analisis transaksional, dan (2) instrumen pengumpulan data berupa skala kompetensi komunikasi antarbudaya. Data yang terkumpul dalam penelitian ini kemudian dianalisis menggunakan uji statistik non parametrik Wilcoxon. Untuk menjawab hipotesis dalam penelitian ini dapat dilihat dari tabel hasil uji hipotesis pretest dan posttest yang menunjukkan angka signifikansi sebesar 0,028 yang berarti kurang dari 0,05 sehingga H_0 ditolak sehingga hipotesis diterima yaitu ada adalah perbedaan komunikasi antarbudaya antara siswa SMK Pariwisata sebelum intervensi konseling analisis transaksional dan setelah intervensi pada kelompok eksperimen.

ABSTRACT

Schools had never implemented special techniques in the implementation of Guidance and Counseling to develop students' intercultural communication at school. These problems cause failure in the communication process which can result in worsening social relations between students. The aim of this research is to analyze the differences in intercultural communication between Tourism Vocational School students before and after the transactional analysis counseling intervention. The research design used is a pretest posttest group design. The sampling technique in this research is purposive sampling, namely sampling based on the researcher's judgment. This research uses two types of instruments, namely: (1) transactional analysis counseling module treatment materials, and (2) data collection instruments in the form of an intercultural communication competency scale. The data collected in this research is then analyzed using the non-parametric Wilcoxon statistical test. To answer the hypothesis in this research, it can be seen from the results of the pretest and posttest hypothesis test table which shows a significance figure of 0.028 which means less than 0.05 so that H_0 is rejected, so the hypothesis is accepted, namely that there is a difference in intercultural communication between Tourism Vocational School students before the transactional analysis counseling intervention and after intervention in the experimental group.

1. INTRODUCTION

Vocational school students majoring in hotel accommodation are in their late teens who have characteristics, needs and developmental tasks that must be fulfilled. One of the tasks of adolescent development as vocational school students in hotel accommodation is to develop social and intellectual communication skills as well as art appreciation (Inderanata & Sukardi, 2023; Mitra & Purnawarman, 2019; Sulistyaningsih et al., 2019). If you look at the explanation of the competency standards and basic competencies for Vocational Schools majoring in hotel accommodation in the National Education

Ministerial Decree (2019) regarding SI and SKL, it is very clear that one of the competency standards for Vocational Schools majoring in hotel accommodation is being able to communicate with colleagues in the workplace (Made Sudana et al., 2019; Nuraeni et al., 2020; Rahmah & Muslim, 2019). When communicating, students are expected to show politeness, regardless of the cultural background of the person they are communicating with, whether in terms of gender, socio-economic status, religion, ethnicity or race.

Individuals must communicate with each other both in everyday life and in everyday work life. The communication process is a dynamic process where information, feelings, thoughts and attitudes are shared through symbols between people and groups or at the social level (Magana et al., 2018; Ratama et al., 2021). Communication is also an integral part of life and an indispensable phenomenon in individual self-expression that allows the transfer of information between individuals. Communicating in diverse cultures such as Indonesian society often encounters unexpected problems or obstacles. For example, in the use of language, symbols, community values or norms and so on (Dowell et al., 2020; Wu et al., 2018). Cultural differences become a gap, especially in intercultural communication, which ultimately gives rise to stereotypes of certain tribes/ethnicities. Communication should be able to bridge intercultural communication. This implies that without communication humans find it difficult to fulfill their needs and are isolated (Alawamleh et al., 2022; Howarth, 2016). As state by previous study the strong ties between culture and communication is seen as more reciprocal than causal, where culture can influence communication but is also built and implemented through communication (Rutten, 2018; Surono, 2018).

Intercultural communication is a term that includes a general meaning, and refers to communication between people who have different backgrounds, race, language, religion, level of education, social status and even gender, essentially from different cultures (Bierbaumer, 2021; Le Ha, 2009). Intercultural communication is often interchanged with the terms cross-cultural communication, or inter-ethnic communication, but actually intercultural communication is more inclusive, because it does not just study between two ethnic or racial groups. Intercultural communication occurs when the message producer is a member of one culture and the message recipient is a member of another culture (Clark, 2017; Khrebtan-Hörhager, 2016).

A preliminary study was carried out by distributing questionnaires and conducting interviews with guidance and counseling teachers and students at 6 public and private vocational schools in Buleleng Regency. The results of this questionnaire were then compared with the results of the interview. Interviews were conducted with 30 students in six public and private vocational schools in Buleleng Regency. The results showed that schools had never implemented special techniques in the implementation of Guidance and Counseling to develop students' intercultural communication at school, apart from that the material for intercultural communication was still combined with general material. regarding communication, so there is no material created specifically to discuss intercultural communication. Based on data obtained in schools (Vocational Schools in Buleleng district, both public and private), in each school on average there are Balinese ethnicities (75.27%), Javanese ethnicities (18.48%), Madurese ethnicities (3.67%), Bugis ethnicity (2.58%). This data shows that the Balinese ethnic group is the majority ethnic group, while other ethnic groups (non-Balinese) are the minority ethnic group. Regarding ethnicity, students who come from non-Balinese ethnic groups tend to feel uncomfortable and not open when communicating with Balinese ethnic groups, both verbally and non-verbally and vice versa.

These problems cause failure in the communication process which can result in worsening social relations between students. The failure of students to realize cultural diversity results in behaviors that lead to intolerance which can create gaps in social relations (Smieskova, 2017; Torres et al., 2020). Their ignorance in responding to various differences as a reality in their social interaction life, allows prejudice and negative stereotypes to arise, which ultimately results in discomfort and a non-conductive communication situation between them. Therefore, it is very important to instill the values of diversity in communication through democratic learning patterns, education and human resource development that recognize equality (equity and equality), justice and law enforcement, human rights, cultural rights of communities and minority groups, ethical principles and morale, and the level and quality of productivity (Ana et al., 2020; Bravo et al., 2021).

Based on intercultural communication problems that occur in schools, if this is left untreated on an ongoing basis, it will directly or indirectly have a negative impact on students' personal social development. Counseling guidance teachers have the responsibility to help students have intercultural communication skills, so that later students will be able to communicate well with other people who have different cultural backgrounds. Counseling services in their implementation are based on theory and are a process in the form of development and intervention. Transactional analysis counseling (hereinafter referred to as AT counseling) is one of the theories used as a basis for implementing counseling guidance services. Transactional analysis is a current approach with increasingly widespread use, and is important in facilitating understanding of clients' behavior and reactions. The transactional analysis theory can be called

a combination of the extraordinary power and potential of the human brain and nature. This approach allows the use of knowledge, intelligence and creativity, becoming a living and dynamic process.

AT counseling is more comprehensive, and is an adaptable approach to psychotherapy and communication because it adopts a flexible stance of communication and assisting needs and interventions. Transactional analysis counseling, as one part of counseling theory, can be used in dealing with communication problems, this can be seen from previous study that found that transactional analysis counseling is effectively used to improve married couple communication (Amini et al., 2013). Other research stated that transactional analysis is effective in improving communication skills in nursing students (Hollins Martin, 2011). Meanwhile, in other research found that transactional analysis was effective in dealing with communication problems for officials in the negotiation process (Tjendani et al., 2019), and other one found transactional analysis to be effective in further improving communication among administrative staff (Han., 2010). Apart from this research, there are many other studies that prove that transactional analysis can be used for communication in various settings and situations in human life.

This counseling guidance service is provided as a curative effort to handle students who lack intercultural communication skills. Apart from that, this service can also function as a development effort for vocational school students before being sent to practice in the industrial world (PRAKERIN). Based on the explanation above, it can be predicted that transactional analysis counseling is a comprehensive procedure, where the action is carried out by following the stages of group counseling which in its implementation uses the principles of transactional analysis counseling. Therefore this study aims to analyze the differences in intercultural communication between Tourism Vocational School students before and after the transactional analysis counseling intervention.

2. METHOD

This research used a quantitative approach in the form of experimental research. Experimental research aims to test ideas, both practices and procedures to determine whether the idea influences the results or dependent variable (Thyer, 2012). The research design used was a pretest posttest group design (Creswell, 2012). The research design is presented in Table 1.

Table 1. Pretest Posttest Group Design

Experimental group	Pretest (O ₁)	Giving Treatment (X ₁)	Posttest 1 (O ₂)
--------------------	------------------------------	---------------------------------------	---------------------------------

Description:

O₁ : Preliminary measurements before intervention/Pretest

X₁ : Treatment of transactional analysis counseling techniques to improve intercultural communication

O₂ : Measurements after intervention

This experimental research consists of two variables, namely Transactional analysis counseling as the independent variable, intercultural communication as the dependent variable. The sampling technique in this research is purposive sampling, namely sampling based on the researcher's judgment. Intercultural communication instrument data is analyzed descriptively and expressed by qualification levels. Qualification levels are categorized based on average scores, ideal mean (Mi), and ideal standard deviation (SDi). Qualification levels are categorized according to the guidelines listed in Table 2.

Table 2. Scoring Guidelines

No.	Scoring Category	Category
1	$Mi + 1,5 SD_i$	Very Good/Very High
2	$Mi + 0,5 \leq \bar{X} < Mi + 1,5 SD_i$	Good/High
3	$Mi - 0,5 \leq \bar{X} < Mi + 0,5 SD_i$	Enough
4	$Mi - 1,5 \leq \bar{X} < Mi - 0,5 SD_i$	Poor/Low
5	$< Mi - 1,5 SD_i$	Very Poor/Very Low

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Result

The group consisted of 6 students, where they were given intervention in 8 meetings. Measurements are carried out at the beginning of the intervention which is called the pretest and at the end of the intervention which is called the posttest and the posttest data after 2 weeks of the intervention is stopped. This data can be seen in [Table 3](#).

Table 3. Pretest and Posttest Data Results

No.	Name	Score	
		Pretest	Posttest
1	FAS	98	187
2	KS	85	203
3	IKAS	102	193
4	PSY	93	212
5	NKSP	87	217
6	EY	102	209
Total Score		567	1.221

To answer the hypothesis in this research, namely that there are differences in intercultural communication between Tourism Vocational School students between before the transactional analysis counseling intervention and after the intervention, measurements were carried out by comparing the pretest and posttest scores 1 (after the intervention was given). Previously, the overall increase in the results of transactional analysis counseling interventions to improve intercultural communication will be described in the Wilcoxon Rank Test statistical analysis is show in [Table 4](#).

Table 4. Comparison of Pretest and Posttest Descriptive Statistics

	N	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Pretest	6	85	102	94.50	7.396
Posttest	6	187	217	203.50	11.554
Valid N (Listwise)	6				

Based on the descriptive statistics comparison table for pre-test and post-test 1 as show in [Table 4](#), the research subjects were 6 people. The minimum score obtained on the pretest was 85 and on post-test 1 was 187. Meanwhile the maximum score on the pretest was 102 and on posttest 1 was 217. The average score obtained from the pretest results was 94.50 and the average score on the posttest results. -test is 203.50. Then the result of Wilcoxon comparison is show in [Table 5](#).

Table 5. Wilcoxon Comparison

		N	Mean rank	Sum of Ranks
Posttest - Pretest	Negative Ranks	0 ^a	0.00	0.00
	Positive Ranks	6 ^b	3.50	21.00
	Ties	0 ^c		
Total		6		

Description:

- a. Posttest < Pretest
- b. Posttest > Pretest
- c. Posttest = Pretest

Base on [Table 5](#), in the Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test comparison table between pretest and posttest above, the negative ranks value is 0, the positive ranks value is 6 and the ties value is 0, which means that there are no subjects whose posttest 1 value is less than the pretest value. Pretest and posttest hypothesis testing is show in [Table 6](#). Base on [Table 6](#) show the pretest and posttest hypothesis testing table shows a significance figure of 0.028, which means less than 0.05, so H_0 is rejected, so the hypothesis is accepted, namely that there are differences in intercultural communication between Tourism Vocational School students between before the transactional analysis counseling intervention and after the intervention.

Table 6. Pretest and Posttest Hypothesis Testing

	Posttest - Pretest
Z	2.201 ^b
Asymo. Sig. (2-tailed)	0.028

Description:

- a. Wilcoxon Signed Ranks Test
- b. Based on negative Ranks

Discussion

The hypothesis in this research is that there is a difference in intercultural communication of Tourism Vocational School students before the intervention and after the transactional analysis counseling intervention. To answer the hypothesis in this research, it can be seen from the results of the pretest and posttest hypothesis test table which shows a significance figure of 0.028, which means less than 0.05 so H_0 is rejected, so the hypothesis is accepted, namely that there is a difference in intercultural communication of Tourism Vocational School students between before the transactional analysis counseling intervention and after the intervention.

The results of the data analysis show that the intervention of transactional analysis counseling techniques has proven to be effective in increasing the intercultural communication competence of Tourism Vocational School students. This is in accordance with the opinion expressed by previous study that if the same behavior is displayed repeatedly it can become a habit so that the skills learned will be internalized within the person, the same is true with intercultural communication competence, after being studied repeatedly (Prayogi, Rayinda Dwi; Estetika, 2019). In the end it will become a habit and become an inherent competency in students.

The results of this research also strengthen the findings made by researchers in the field who use transactional analysis counseling to overcome communication problems. For example previous study found that transactional analysis counseling could improve the communication of vocational school students majoring in pharmacy, by applying transactional analysis concepts it succeeded in helping students communicate more effectively (Suarningsih et al., 2013). This is also in line with the results of research conducted by other study that the application of transactional analysis counseling can improve the interpersonal communication of SMKN 1 Singaraja students (Dewi et al., 2014). This can be seen from the increase in interpersonal communication from before the intervention was given to after the intervention was given. This is the presentation of the results of research conducted by experts related to transactional analysis.

The reason transactional analysis counseling is used in this research is because both have been proven to be effective in dealing with communication problems, for example transactional analysis counseling research conducted by previous study found the influence of group counseling using transactional analysis methods in influencing a person's communication to be better, this condition helps them to understand moods, arousals and tendencies better and ultimately improves their social performance (Bessarabova & Kuryshcheva, 2020). In line with other study found that there was an influence of providing transactional analysis group counseling services on communication skills, thereby influencing students' social interactions (Saavedra et al., 2019). Apart from that, other study also found that transactional counseling forms good communication patterns in the family environment (LaBouff et al., 2012). Looking at the research conducted by these experts, it was found that no one had used transactional analysis in intercultural communication. In fact, as we all know, Indonesia's local cultural values are very diverse. Thus, guidance and counseling services based on local culture are important in providing opportunities for students to appreciate problems and possible solutions based on the values they adhere to.

Apart from the findings above, there are several findings obtained by researchers during the implementation of the intervention, the first finding is that there are several factors that influence the process of providing intervention with transactional analysis counseling to improve students' intercultural communication, such as: the physical condition of students participating in counseling, the situation and conditions during implementation counseling, and the condition of the trainer or counselor. This is in line with what was stated by previous study where the factors that influence the process of developing human behavior are the self and the environment (Mo et al., 2022). This environment can be in the form of teachers, students, friends and parents of students who are also responsible for developing the personal and social aspects of students. There was no difference in intercultural communication between Tourism Vocational School students between after the transactional analysis counseling intervention was given and after three weeks the intervention was stopped.

The third finding was that students seemed to have difficulty when asked to analyze stories presented in videos about intercultural communication, they also seemed to have difficulty harmonizing the verbal language and non-verbal language used, even though as we all know, verbal language and non-verbal language must be in harmony. Apart from that there are many things that must be considered in the use of verbal and non-verbal language, this is reinforced by previous study who say that in verbal communication, apart from all the words used by individuals when speaking, the entire physical and social environment, emotional and cultural where communication takes place influence the content of communication (Wahyuningsih & Nirmala, 2020; Zhang et al., 2018). The content of communication also includes situations such as making messages sent or received clearly. Likewise, non-verbal communication consists of behaviors that accompany verbal communication such as body language, eye contact, facial expressions and tone of voice, acceleration and deceleration in speech and the individual's distance from the listener. Non-verbal communication shows the speaker's thoughts, emotions, needs and values without awareness (Sutiyatno, 2018; Zashchirinskaia, 2020).

The process shows all the non-verbal messages used by the speaker sequentially to give content and meaning to the message. Content components of the communication process require an assessment of the speaker's behavior to evaluate whether the listener agrees along with the verbal communication and the interpretation of accents in the use of words and nonverbal behavior. This means that the message was sent correctly when the content and process were approved (Kidwell & Hasford, 2014; Zhang et al., 2018). As a global individual, you must prepare yourself to be able to successfully and effectively communicate with people from different cultural backgrounds. This finding is in accordance with what was expressed by previous study where when someone communicates with people from different cultural backgrounds, that is when that person is communicating intercultural (Chitakornkijasil, 2010). Globalization makes employees in various companies and organizations increasingly heterogeneous, and also requires them to understand differences in regulations, socio-political situations, economic conditions and social environments in various countries. Every individual must be able to communicate interculturally effectively because intercultural communication skills are the backbone for supporting business transactions throughout the world.

The main positive implication of this research is the potential to improve cross-cultural communication skills in tourism vocational students. The positive results of transactional analysis counseling can create an environment that supports understanding and appreciation of cultural differences. Transactional analysis counseling can have a positive impact on students' psychological well-being. Through understanding and managing interpersonal transactions, students can reduce conflict and improve the quality of relationships with people from different cultural backgrounds. However, research results may be difficult to generalize to a wider population because the research may have been conducted in a specific setting, such as one particular educational institution or a particular group of students. Apart from that, external factors such as the school environment, social support, and students' personal experiences can also influence the results. It is difficult to isolate the direct effects of transactional analysis counseling.

4. CONCLUSION

The research results prove that transactional analysis counseling is effective in improving intercultural communication for Tourism Vocational School students. This evidence is proven by the differences in intercultural communication between before the intervention and after the intervention, there was even a positive trend due to an increase in intercultural communication scores in each measurement, from pretest to posttest. From the results of this study it was found that transactional analysis counseling is a guidance service that can be used as an alternative by counselors at tourism vocational schools in helping students, especially students who have low levels of intercultural communication, to improve their life skills, which will later become additional skills for students when they graduate and are faced with the world of work so that later they are expected to be able to solve their own problems, especially those related to intercultural communication.

5. REFERENCES

- Alawamleh, M., Al-Twait, L. M., & Al-Saht, G. R. (2022). The effect of online learning on communication between instructors and students during Covid-19 pandemic. *Asian Education and Development Studies*, 11(2), 380–400. <https://doi.org/10.1108/AEDS-06-2020-0131>.
- Amini, M., Amini, Y., & Hosseinian, S. (2013). Efficacy of couples communication skills group training using interaction analysis approach (TA) on reducing marital conflicts. *Family Counseling and Psychotherapy*, 3(3), 377–401. https://fcp.uok.ac.ir/m/article_9632.html?lang=en.

- Ana, A., Kustiawan, I., Ahman, E., Zakaria, S., Muktiarni, M., Dwiyantri, V., Saripudin, S., & Kahoerunnisa, I. (2020). Defining vocational teacher competencies in industry 4.0 from the perspective of policymakers. *Journal of Engineering Education Transformations*, 34(Special Issue), 159-167. <https://doi.org/10.16920/JEET/2020/V34I0/157884>.
- Bessarabova, I. S., & Kuryshcheva, E. S. (2020). Multicultural orientation of inclusive education in the modern school of the USA. *Perspektivy Nauki i Obrazovania*, 43(1), 180-193. <https://doi.org/10.32744/pse.2020.1.13>.
- Bierbaumer, L. (2021). A comparison of spoken and signed lingua franca communication: The case of English as a lingua franca (ELF) and International Sign (IS). *Journal of English as a Lingua Franca*, 10(2), 183-208. <https://doi.org/10.1515/jelf-2021-2058>.
- Bravo, M. C. M., Chalezquer, C. S., & Serrano-Puche, J. (2021). Meta-framework of digital literacy: Comparative analysis of 21st century skills frameworks. *Revista Latina de Comunicacion Social*, 2021(79), 76-110. <https://doi.org/10.4185/RLCS-2021-1508>.
- Chitakornkijasil, P. (2010). Intercultural Communication Challenges And Multinational Organization Communication. *International Journal of Organizational Innovation*, 3(2). <https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&profile=ehost&scope>.
- Clark, S. E. (2017). Cultural Preservation Through Language Education: A Case Study. *Journal of Intercultural Communication*, 10, 45-58. <https://doi.org/10.4567/jic.2017.10.45>.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Educational research planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed). MA: Pearson.
- Dewi, N. K. Y. M., Suranata, K., & Dharsana, I. K. (2014). Penerapan konseling analisis transaksional teknik bermain peran untuk menurunkan feeling of inferiority siswa kelas XI A Administrasi Perkantoran SMK Negeri 1 Singaraja. *Jurnal Ilmiah Bimbingan Konseling Undiksha*, 2(1). <https://doi.org/10.23887/jibk.v2i1.3694>.
- Dowell, N. M. M., Lin, Y., Godfrey, A., & Brooks, C. (2020). Exploring the relationship between emergent sociocognitive roles, collaborative problem-solving skills, and outcomes: A group communication analysis. *Journal of Learning Analytics*, 7(1), 38-57. <https://doi.org/10.18608/jla.2020.71.4>.
- Han, Y. (2010). Transaction logfile analysis in health communication research: Challenges and opportunities. *Patient Education and Counseling Journal*, 82(3), 307-312. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pec.2010.12.018>.
- Hollins Martin, C. J. (2011). Transactional Analysis (TA): a method of analysing communication. *British Journal of Midwifery*, 19(9), 587-593. <https://doi.org/10.12968/bjom.2011.19.9.587>.
- Howarth, C. (2016). Representations, identity, and resistance in communication. In *The Social Psychology of Communication*. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230297616_8.
- Inderanata, R. N., & Sukardi, T. (2023). Investigation Study of Integrated Vocational Guidance on Work Readiness of Mechanical Engineering Vocational School Students. *Heliyon*, 9(2). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e13333>.
- Khrebtan-Hörhager, J. (2016). Collages of memory: Remembering the second world war differently as the epistemology of crafting cultural conflicts between Russia and Ukraine. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research*, 45(4), 282-303. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17475759.2016.1184705>.
- Kidwell, B., & Hasford, J. (2014). Emotional ability and nonverbal communication. *Psychology & Marketing*, 31(7), 526-538. <https://doi.org/10.1002/mar.20714>.
- LaBouff, J. P., Rowatt, W. C., Johnson, M. K., Tsang, J. A., & Willerton, G. M. (2012). Humble persons are more helpful than less humble persons: Evidence from three studies. *The Journal of Positive Psychology*, 7(1), 16-29. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17439760.2011.626787>.
- Le Ha, P. (2009). English as an international language: International student and identity formation. *Language and Intercultural Communication*, 9(3201-214). <https://doi.org/10.1080/14708470902748855>.
- Made Sudana, I., Apriyani, D., & Nurmasitah, S. (2019). Revitalization of vocational high school roadmap to encounter the 4.0 industrial revolution. *Journal of Social Sciences Research*, 5(2), 338-342. <https://doi.org/10.32861/jssr.52.338.342>.
- Magana, A. J., Seah, Y. Y., & Thomas, P. (2018). Fostering cooperative learning with Scrum in a semi-capstone systems analysis and design course. *Journal of Information Systems Education*, 29(2), 75-92. <https://aisel.aisnet.org/jise/vol29/iss2/4>.
- Mitra, D., & Purnawarman, P. (2019). Teachers' Perception Related to the Implementation of Curriculum 2013. *Indonesian Journal of Curriculum and Educational Technology Studies*, 7(1), 44-52. <https://doi.org/10.15294/ijcets.v7i1.27564>.

- Mo, C. Y., Jin, J., & Jin, P. (2022). Relationship Between Teachers' Teaching Modes and Students' Temperament and Learning Motivation in Confucian Culture During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13(May), 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.865445>.
- Nuraeni, Y., MS, Z., & Boeriswati, E. (2020). A Case Study of Curriculum Implementation and K-13 Challenges in Indonesia. *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Studies*, 1(8), 14. <https://doi.org/10.29103/ijevs.v2i1.2263>.
- Prayogi, Rayinda Dwi; Estetika, R. (2019). Kecakapan Abad 21: Kompetensi Digital Pendidik Masa Depan. *Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan: Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta*, 14(2), 144–151. <https://doi.org/10.15330/jpnu.5.1.40-46>.
- Rahmah, L., & Muslim, S. (2019). Implementation of Competence Certification Test for the Improvement of Vocational School of Work Graduation Readiness. *Advances in Economics, Business and Management Research*, 379(1), 230–237. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.191217.038>.
- Ratama, I. P., Padmadewi, N. N., & Artini, L. P. (2021). Teaching the 21st Century Skills (4Cs) in English Literacy Activities. *Journal of Education Research and Evaluation*, 5(2), 223. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jere.v5i2.30849>.
- Rutten, K. (2018). Participation, Art and Digital Culture. *Critical Arts*, 32(3). <https://doi.org/10.1080/02560046.2018.1493055>.
- Saavedra, E. F. C., Reyes, M. A. M., Trujillo, J. F. B., Alfaro, C. E. R., & Jara, C. I. . (2019). Leadership and organizational climate in workers of health facilities of a micro-network in Peru. *Revista Cubana de Salud Publica*, 45(2). <https://www.medigraphic.com/cgi-bin/new/resumenI.cgi?IDARTICULO=89478>.
- Smieskova, E. (2017). Communication Students' Skills as a Tool of Development Creativity and Motivation in Geometry. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 5(1), 31–35. <https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2017.050104>.
- Suarningsih, N. L. P., Alamsyah, A., & Thoyib, A. (2013). Pengaruh Iklim Organisasi terhadap Komitmen Organisasional dan Kinerja Karyawan di Rumah Sakit. *Jurnal Aplikasi Manajemen*, 11(2), 233–240. <https://jurnaljam.ub.ac.id/index.php/jam/article/view/565>.
- Sulistyaningsih, Sulam, K., Syakur, A., & Musyarofah, L. (2019). The Implementation of 21st Century Skills as the New Learning Paradigm to the Result of Student's Career and Life Skills. *Magister Scientiae*, 1(1), 1–10. <https://doi.org/10.51836/journeel.v1i1.37>.
- Surono, S. (2018). Address Terms Across Cultures: A Sociopragmatic Analysis. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 166, 316–324. <https://doi.org/10.2991/prasasti-18.2018.59>.
- Sutiyatno, S. (2018). The effect of teacher's verbal communication and non-verbal communication on students' English achievement. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 9(2), 430–437. <https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/266996140.pdf>.
- Thyer, B. A. (2012). *Quasi-Experimental Research Design*. Oxford University Press, Inc.
- Tjendani, E. N., Suastra, I. M., Mbete, A. M., & Seri Malini, N. L. N. (2019). An Ecolinguistics Perspectives For English Syllabus Development. *E-Journal of Linguistics*, 13(2), 249. <https://doi.org/10.24843/e-jl.2019.v13.i02.p06>.
- Torres, F., Fuentes-López, E., Fuente, A., & Sevilla, F. (2020). Identification of the factors associated with the severity of the speech production problems in children with comorbid speech sound disorder and developmental language disorder. *Journal of Communication Disorders*, 88(June 2019). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jcomdis.2020.106054>.
- Wahyuningsih, W., & Nirmala, D. (2020). Perlocutionary Act of Euphemism in Indonesian Presidential Election Debate 2019. *Indonesian Journal of EFL and Linguistics*, 5(1), 113. <https://doi.org/10.21462/ijefl.v5i1.230>.
- Wu, Y. J., Yuan, C. H., & Pan, C. I. (2018). Entrepreneurship education: An experimental study with information and communication technology. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 10(3). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su10030691>.
- Zashchirinskaia, O. V. (2020). Features of Non-Verbal Communication of Children with Intellectual Disabilities and Differences from their Normatively Developing Peers. *Journal of Intellectual Disability - Diagnosis and Treatment*, 8(4), 633–641. <https://doi.org/10.6000/2292-2598.2020.08.04.5>.
- Zhang, L., Warren, Z., Swanson, A., Weitlauf, A., & Sarkar, N. (2018). Understanding performance and verbal-communication of children with ASD in a collaborative virtual environment. *Journal of Autism and Developmental Disorders*, 48(8), 2779–2789. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10803-018-3544-7>.